A U.K. resident company, Y, owns all of the shares in a U.S. resident company, Z. Y is wholly owned by X, a German resident company that would not qualify for all of the benefits of the U.S.-Germany income tax treaty but may qualify for benefits with respect to certain items of income under the “active trade or business” test of the U.S.-Germany treaty. X, in turn, is wholly owned by W, a French resident company that is substantially and regularly traded on the Paris Stock Exchange. Z pays a dividend to Y. Y qualifies for benefits under paragraph 3 of Article 23 (derivative benefits test), assuming that the base erosion requirements of subparagraph 3(b) of Article 23 are met.

Y is directly owned by X, which is not an equivalent beneficiary within the meaning of subparagraph 7(d)(i) of Article 23 (X does not qualify for all of the benefits of the U.S.-Germany tax treaty). However, Y is also indirectly owned by W and W may be an equivalent beneficiary. Y would not be entitled to the zero rate of withholding tax on dividends available under the Convention because W is not an equivalent beneficiary with respect to the zero rate of withholding tax since W is not eligible for such rate under the U.S.-France income tax treaty. W qualifies as an equivalent beneficiary with respect to the 5 percent maximum rate of withholding tax because (a) it is a French resident company whose shares are substantially and regularly traded on a recognized stock exchange, within the meaning of the Limitation on Benefits Article of the U.S.-France income tax treaty and (b) the dividend withholding rate in the treaty between the United States and France is 5 percent. Accordingly, U.S. withholding tax on the dividend from Z to Y will be imposed at a rate of 5 percent in accordance with subparagraph 2(a) of Article 10.